Community-based forest resource conflict management

VOLUME 1

A TRAINING PACKAGE

RECOFTC

VOLUME 1

Community-based forest resource conflict management

A TRAINING PACKAGE

by
KATHERINE MEANS
CYNTHIA JOSAYMA
with
ERIK NIELSEN
VITOON VIRIYASAKULTORN

FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS
ROME, 2002

The designations employed and the presentation of material in this information product do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

All rights reserved. Reproduction and dissemination of material in this information product for educational or other non-commercial purposes are authorized without any prior written permission from the copyright holders provided the source is fully acknowledged. Reproduction of material in this information product for resale or other commercial purposes is prohibited without written permission of the copyright holders. Applications for such permission should be addressed to the Chief, Publishing Management Service, Information Division, FAO, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00100 Rome, Italy or by e-mail to copyright@fao.org

© FAO 2002

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This publication is the result of a significant commitment by numerous individuals over the past five years.

The Forestry Policy and Planning Division (FONP) of FAO in close collaboration with the Regional Community Forestry Training Center (RECOFTC), in Bangkok, Thailand, has supported the development of a comprehensive training package on Community-Based Forest Resource Conflict Management.

The authors wish to acknowledge members of the original design team who conceived of the training materials package in 1995. They were Roland Benson, Gilbert Braganza, Cynthia Josayma, Suwit Laohasirwong, Wongsa Kongdee, Sapana Mala, Manju Raju, Vitoon Viriyasakultorn, Wang Wanying and Katherine Warner.

During the development and evolution of the training package there were several individuals that provided insightful comments and feedback on earlier drafts of the publication. The authors would like to thank Stephan Baas, Lydia Braakman, Peter Castro, Roshi Chand, Alison Cleary, Karen Edwards, Larry Fisher, David Ganz, Michelle Gauthier, Helen Gillman, Scott Jones, Terry Leary, Lennart Ljungman, Violet Matiru, Manuel Paveri, Christine Pendzich, Dominique Reeb, Steve Sherwood, Margret Vidar, Katherine Warner and Sejal Worah.

The authors would also like to extend their appreciation to Anna Sherwood and Linda Mitchell for co-ordinating the overall publication process. Peter Castro was also responsible for providing editorial support throughout the development of the materials and he was responsible for editing the case study section.

Erik Nielsen had a central role in the overall management and development of the training package as the coordinator of activities related to natural resource conflict management for the former Community Forestry Unit at FAO. Vitoon Viriyasakultorn was responsible for the co-ordination and field testing of the package at RECOFTC.

Mary Schlarb was responsible for the overall technical-edit and she prepared the annotated bibliography section. Jane Shaw copy-edited the materials and reviewed the proofs. Margareta Nilsson prepared all the illustrations and Cecilia Valli designed the layout.

Support and funding for this publication was provided by the multidonor trust fund, the Forests, Trees and People Programme (FTPP), which works to increase the social and economic equity and improve well-being, especially of the poor, through the support of collaborative and sustainable management of trees, forests and other natural resources. Other significant support, both financial and in kind, was provided by RECOFTC and the FAO Forestry Department.

CONTENTS VOLUME 1

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iii

USER'S GUIDE TO THE TRAINING PACKAGE 1

INTRODUCTION 1
ASSUMPTIONS OF THE TRAINING PACKAGE 5
OBJECTIVES OF THE TRAINING PACKAGE 6
WHO WILL USE THE TRAINING PACKAGE? 7
WHAT IS IN THE TRAINING PACKAGE? 7
HOW TO USE THE TRAINING PACKAGE 10
A WAY FORWARD 12
GLOSSARY OF TERMS USED IN THE TRAINING PACKAGE 13
WHAT DO THE ICONS MEAN? 15
ACRONYMS 16

THE MAP OF THE PROCESS 19

KEY STEPS IN A COLLABORATIVE APPROACH TO CONFLICT MANAGEMENT 19
A COLLABORATIVE APPROACH TO MANAGING CONFLICT IN COMMUNITY-BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT 20
KEY ELEMENTS SUPPORTING THE PROCESS 22

SECTION 1 **AN INTRODUCTION TO CONFLICT IN COMMUNITY-BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT 25**

1.1 UNDERSTANDING CONFLICT 27
1.2 WHAT IS COMMUNITY-BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT? 27
1.3 THE MANY FACETS OF CONFLICT 33
1.4 LOCATING CONFLICT IN COMMUNITY-BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT 47
1.5 SECTION SUMMARY 56
1.6 REFERENCES 58

SECTION 2 **COLLABORATION AND CONFLICT 61**

2.1 RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN COLLABORATIVE MANAGEMENT AND CONFLICT 63
2.2 ESSENTIAL CONSIDERATIONS ABOUT COLLABORATION 71
2.3 CONSTRAINTS TO COLLABORATION 81
2.4 SECTION SUMMARY 85
2.5 REFERENCES 87

SECTION 3 **ANALYSING CONFLICT** **89**

3.1 WHAT DO WE WANT TO ACHIEVE BY ANALYSING CONFLICT? 91
3.2 EXPLORING CAUSES OF CONFLICT 96
3.3 IDENTIFYING AND ANALYSING STAKEHOLDERS 112
3.4 OTHER IMPORTANT CONSIDERATIONS IN CONFLICT ANALYSIS 134
3.5 SECTION SUMMARY 154
3.6 REFERENCES 156

SECTION 4 **DEVELOPING A STRATEGY FOR MANAGING CONFLICTS** **159**

4.1 DIRECTION SETTING 161
4.2 CHOICES IN CONFLICT MANAGEMENT 163
4.3 BUILDING CAPACITY FOR MANAGING CONFLICTS 177
4.4 BEST ALTERNATIVE TO A NEGOTIATED AGREEMENT (BATNA) 179
4.5 BRINGING OTHER STAKEHOLDERS TO THE TABLE 186
4.6 DO YOU NEED AN INTERMEDIARY? 187
4.7 SECTION SUMMARY 191
4.8 REFERENCES 193

SECTION 5 **NEGOTIATIONS AND BUILDING AGREEMENTS** **195**

5.1 SOME FUNDAMENTALS 197
5.2 CONFIRMING THE PROCESS 199
5.3 STARTING NEGOTIATIONS 204
5.4 FINDING COMMON GROUND 209
5.5 EXPANDING OPTIONS 211
5.6 THE ROLE OF INFORMATION 215
5.7 ESTABLISHING AGREEMENT 218
5.8 SECTION SUMMARY 228
5.9 REFERENCES 230

SECTION 6 **ESSENTIAL COMMUNICATION SKILLS FOR FACILITATORS IN CONFLICT MANAGEMENT** **233**

6.1 ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF FACILITATORS 235
6.2 LEARNING COMMUNICATION SKILLS 237
6.3 THE ROLE OF A RECORDER 246
6.4 INTERVENTIONS WHEN DIFFICULTIES ARISE 249
6.5 WHAT TO DO IF THE PROCESS BREAKS DOWN 253
6.6 SECTION SUMMARY 253
6.7 REFERENCES 255

SECTION 7 **FURTHER READING AND REFERENCES** **257**

REFERENCES 268

SECTION 8 **CASE STUDIES** **275**

8.1 INTRODUCTION 277
8.2 EXERCISE DIRECTIONS 278
8.3 ALTERNATIVE USES OF THE CASE STUDY ACTIVE LEARNING APPROACH 282
8.4 CASE STUDY 1: JOINT FOREST MANAGEMENT AND CONFLICT IN HARYANA, INDIA 285
8.5 CASE STUDY 2: LEARNING TO RESOLVE CONFLICTS IN COMMUNITY FORESTRY: A CASE STUDY FROM DHUNGESHORI, NEPAL 295
8.6 CASE STUDY 3: SUPPORTING LOCAL MECHANISMS FOR CONFLICT RESOLUTION IN THE CHIANG MAI HIGHLANDS, THAILAND 303
8.7 CASE STUDY 4: *SOKSHING* CONFLICTS IN BHUTAN 313

TABLES, FIGURES AND BOXES

TABLES

TABLE 2.1	GUIDELINES FOR A COLLABORATIVE PROCESS	78
TABLE 3.1	TYPES OF ISSUE THAT CONTRIBUTE TO A CONFLICT	105
TABLE 3.2	EXAMPLE OF AN ISSUES ANALYSIS TABLE	107
TABLE 3.3	CHARACTERISTICS OF DIFFERENT RESPONSES TO CONFLICT	120
TABLE 3.4	COMPARING POSITIONS AND INTERESTS	124
TABLE 3.5	COMMON PROBLEMS OF POLICY AND LEGISLATION THAT RESULT IN CONFLICT	148
TABLE 4.1	THE STRENGTHS AND LIMITATIONS OF DIFFERENT SYSTEMS OF CONFLICT MANAGEMENT	172
TABLE 5.1	MAJOR STAGES IN THE NEGOTIATION PROCESS	198
TABLE 5.2	CHECKLIST FOR ASSESSING AND ADAPTING EXISTING NEGOTIATION PRACTICES	202
TABLE 5.3	THE ROLES OF PARTICIPANTS AND THIRD PARTIES	205
TABLE 5.4	INFORMATION PROBLEMS AND POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS	216
TABLE 8.1	ZANGMO'S AND SONAM'S *SOKSHINGS*	319

FIGURES

FIGURE 3.1	KEY QUESTIONS TO ASSIST DECISIONS ABOUT ACTING IN A CONFLICT	92
FIGURE 3.2	AN EXAMPLE OF A ROOT CAUSE ANALYSIS	100
FIGURE 3.3	DIFFERENT VIEWPOINTS: AFFECTED STAKEHOLDERS AND STAKEHOLDER POWER	116
FIGURE 3.4	IMPROVING OPPORTUNITIES FOR COLLABORATION: MOVING FROM POSITIONS TO INTERESTS	125
FIGURE 3.5	APPLYING THE ONION TO A CONFLICT IN COMMUNITY FORESTRY	127
FIGURE 3.6	ANALYSIS OF THE RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN STAKEHOLDERS AND FOREST RESOURCES	130
FIGURE 3.7	ANALYSIS OF THE RELATIONSHIPS AMONG STAKEHOLDERS	132
FIGURE 3.8	WHAT'S IN A DAY?	141
FIGURE 3.9	RELATIONSHIPS AMONG DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF POLICY	147
FIGURE 4.1	SOME KEY QUESTIONS IN SELECTING A STRATEGY	162
FIGURE 5.1	AN EXAMPLE OF DEVELOPING A COMMON GOALS STATEMENT	210

BOXES

BOX 1.1	WHAT ARE STAKEHOLDERS?	30
BOX 1.2	CONFLICT AS A CATALYST FOR CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT	35
BOX 1.3	TIME LINE OF ESCALATING CONFLICT	37
BOX 1.4	CONFLICTS WITHIN A COMMUNITY	43
BOX 1.5	CONFLICT BETWEEN LOCAL COMMUNITIES AND OUTSIDE GROUPS	45
BOX 1.6	CONFLICTS ARISING FROM DIFFICULTIES IN IDENTIFYING STAKEHOLDERS	49
BOX 1.7	INADEQUATE INFORMATION SHARING LEADING TO CONFLICT	51
BOX 1.8	CONFLICT BETWEEN INCOMPATIBLE LOCAL AND NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES	52

BOX 1.9	CONFLICTS FROM DIFFERING LEGAL ORDERS	53
BOX 1.10	CONFLICTS ARISING FROM POOR INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY	54
BOX 1.11	CONFLICTS FROM INADEQUATE MONITORING	55
BOX 2.1	DHUNGESHORI COMMUNITY FOREST USER GROUP	68
BOX 2.2	WHAT IS THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN POWER AND AUTHORITY?	84
BOX 3.1	GAPS AND DIFFERENCES: A CASE FROM NEPAL	110
BOX 3.2	USING AND LINKING PARTICIPATORY CONFLICT ANALYSIS ACTIVITIES	111
BOX 3.3	AN EXAMPLE OF HOW IDENTIFYING A COMMON INTEREST MAY LEAD TO RESOLUTION AGREEMENTS	128
BOX 3.4	CHARACTERISTICS OF CULTURAL DIFFERENCES	136
BOX 3.5	EXAMINING GENDER ROLES	138
BOX 3.6	UNDERSTANDING TENURE	151
BOX 4.1	WHEN CUSTOMARY CONFLICT MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS DO NOT WORK AMONG COMMUNITIES	167
BOX 4.2	FACTORS THAT STAKEHOLDERS CONSIDER IN CHOOSING THE MOST APPROPRIATE CONFLICT MANAGEMENT STRATEGY	175
BOX 4.3	COMBINING CONFLICT MANAGEMENT APPROACHES	176
BOX 4.4	BATNA GUIDELINES	181
BOX 4.5	KEY POINTS IN APPLYING A BATNA	182
BOX 4.6	AN EXAMPLE OF A BATNA IN PRACTICE	183
BOX 4.7	DIFFERENT KINDS OF THIRD PARTY ASSISTANCE	189
BOX 5.1	USEFUL QUESTIONS IN DESIGNING AN ALTERNATIVE CONFLICT MANAGEMENT PROCESS	200
BOX 5.2	INTRODUCTIONS TO NEGOTIATIONS: AN EXAMPLE	205
BOX 5.3	A COMMUNICATIONS AGREEMENT	208
BOX 5.4	MECHANISMS TO SUPPORT THE EXAMINATION AND ASSESSMENT OF OPTIONS	213
BOX 5.5	MERGING INFORMATION FROM DIFFERENT KNOWLEDGE SYSTEMS	217
BOX 5.6	ESTABLISHING CRITERIA TO ASSESS OPTIONS	220
BOX 5.7	CHECKLIST FOR IMPLEMENTATION AND MONITORING	222
BOX 5.8	CHARACTERISTICS OF A DURABLE AGREEMENT	225
BOX 6.1	THE ROLE OF A FACILITATOR	237
BOX 6.2	FACILITATION HINTS IN SITUATIONS OF CULTURAL AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC DIVERSITY	240
BOX 6.3	GUIDELINES FOR ACTIVE LISTENING	242
BOX 6.4	WHERE WORDS AND GESTURES DO NOT TELL THE SAME STORY	246
BOX 6.5	PRINCIPLES FOR RECORDING	247
BOX 6.6	RECORDING HINTS	247
BOX 8.1	“WHAT HAPPENED?” QUESTIONS	280
BOX 8.2	ANALYSIS QUESTIONS	281

For additional copies of the Training Package please contact:
Forestry Policy and Institutions Branch
Forestry Department
Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
Viale delle Terme di Caracalla - 00100 Rome Italy
email: fonp-documents@fao.org